



Dedeng Yusuf Maolani &lt;dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id&gt;

---

**Submit Article for CEM Journal**

5 pesan

**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani** <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>

26 November 2022 14.27

Kepada: cemjournal@gmail.com

Dear Editor  
CEM Journal

We have read and used scientific articles published in CEM Journal.

The performance of the CEM Journal was excellent, and the published article helped us conduct research and write scientific reports.

I am Dedeng Yusuf Maolani, representing other authors and Lecturers from UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia.

We have completed a scientific article entitled "***Collaborative Governance of Hajj Implementation in Indonesia: A Case Study at the Office of the Ministry of Religion in Bandung.***"

We hope this article can be published in the CEM Journal because exciting findings in the scientific report can become new treasures in science, especially in social sciences.

We are willing to go through the review process following CEM Journal standards.

Best Regards,

Dedeng Yusuf Maolani  
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

**CEMJ\_Article\_Dedeng.doc**

834K

---

**Sebastian Jarzębowski** <cemjournal@gmail.com>

5 Desember 2022 16.12

Kepada: Dedeng Yusuf Maolani &lt;dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id&gt;

Dear  
Dedeng Yusuf Maolani et.al  
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia.

The CEM Journal Editorial Board has received your team article. I appreciate your team's interest in CEM Journal.

Your team article will be processed according to the publication standards at CEM Journal.

I beg your team to be patient while waiting for the notification from the CEM Journal Editorial Board.

Always check your team email because the correspondence is only via email.

Best Regards,

--

Sebastian Jarzębowski  
Editorial Board CEM Journal

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani** <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>  
Kepada: "Sebastian Jarzębowski" <cemjournal@gmail.com>

8 Desember 2022 11.40

Dear Editor  
CEM Journal

Thank you for your response.

We were happy to wait for the next stage.

**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani**  
**UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia**  
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

**Sebastian Jarzębowski** <cemjournal@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dedeng Yusuf Maolani <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>

25 Desember 2022 16.34

Dear  
Dedeng Yusuf Maolani, et. al  
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to CEM Journal.

We have completed our evaluation, and the reviewers recommend reconsidering your manuscript following minor revisions. Please resubmit your revised manuscript by January 7<sup>th</sup>, 2023, or ask whether an alternate date would be acceptable. We invite your team to send it back after addressing the comments below.

When revising your team manuscript, consider carefully all issues mentioned in the reviewers' comments: outline every change made in response to their comments and provide suitable explanations for any remarks not addressed. Please also note that the revised submission may need to be re-reviewed.

To submit your team revised manuscript, please log in as an author(s) at this email, and navigate to the "Revision" folder.

CEM Journal values your contribution, and I look forward to receiving your team revised manuscript.

Editor and Reviewer comments:

Reviewer #1:

1. Title: To increase the clarity and focus of the title, it is advisable to reduce specific information, such as "*A Case Study at the Office of the Ministry of Religion in Bandung*," and consider a more general title that reflects the main issues discussed, for example: "*Collaborative Governance in Hajj Implementation: A Study in Bandung City*."
2. In the abstract, it is better to provide a more detailed summary of the research methodology used. Include the number of respondents or participants involved in observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation studies. This will provide a better understanding of the quality and validity of the research.
3. Abstract: It is necessary to explain further why collaborative governance in the implementation of Hajj in Bandung has not been effective. Identify the factors leading to a lack of communication, coordination, and stakeholder cooperation.
4. Abstract: When introducing the collaborative governance model in organizing Hajj, explain more clearly what is meant by "*triple helix*" and "*Penta helix*." Explain why the triple helix model is ineffective and how adding stakeholders can increase its effectiveness.
5. Keywords: Add some additional keywords that are more specific to cover important aspects of the research, for example, "*Collaborative Governance Models, Stakeholder Cooperation, Hajj Implementation, Bandung City*."

I hope you can make improvements as soon as possible and send the revised article again via this email.

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

---

**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani** <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>

27 Desember 2022 07.44

Kepada: "Sebastian Jarzębowski" <cemjournal@gmail.com>

Dear  
Editor CEM Journal

Thank you for the Editorial Board response to CEM Journal.

We have read the revised instructions from the Reviewers.  
We will immediately correct the article according to the reviewers.

Best Regards,

**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani**  
**UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia**  
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Dedeng Yusuf Maolani &lt;dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id&gt;

## Revision Article for CEM Journal

4 pesan

**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani** <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>  
Kepada: "Sebastian Jarzębowski" <cemjournal@gmail.com>

7 Januari 2023 11.53

Dear  
Editor CEM Journal

Thank you for the patience of the CEM Journal Editorial Board. We were waiting for the revision of our article.

We have made improvements according to the reviewer's instructions. We will be happy if there are still points that need further improvement in the article.

The revised Article is Attached.

Best Regards,

Dedeng Yusuf Maolani  
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

 **Revision1\_CEMJ\_Article\_Dedeng.doc**  
849K

**Sebastian Jarzębowski** <cemjournal@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dedeng Yusuf Maolani <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>

19 Februari 2023 15.32

Dear

Dedeng Yusuf Maolani, et. al  
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

Thank you for your team's efforts to improve your team article.

Based on the Reviewers' considerations, the article has, at some point, increased.  
However, your team has to improve on a few more points. Hopefully, your team is willing to do it.

Please follow the following revision instructions:  
#Reviewer 2:

1. Review the alignment between the research objectives and the findings expressed in the abstract. Ensure that the abstract accurately reflects what has been studied in the research, including focusing on the effectiveness analysis and collaborative governance models in organizing Hajj in Bandung.
2. In the abstract, add a sentence or two that summarizes the research findings. This will provide a clearer picture of what is found in the effectiveness analysis and collaborative governance models in implementing Hajj in Bandung.
3. Review the use of the term "*good coordination and cooperation*" in the abstract. Provide a more specific definition of what is meant by "good coordination and cooperation" between stakeholders in organizing Hajj. This will provide a clearer understanding of the critical factors in achieving effective implementation.
4. Expansion of the explanation regarding the role and contribution of each stakeholder in the proposed Penta helix model. Explain in detail how the participation of universities, private companies, communities, and the mass media can help achieve the goal of collaborative governance in organizing Hajj in Bandung.
5. Critically evaluate the weaknesses of the suggested collaborative governance model and the challenges that may be faced in implementing it. Discuss proposed steps or strategies to overcome these obstacles, including improving communication, coordination, and stakeholder cooperation.

Articles that have been revised and please send them back via this email.

--

Sebastian Jarzębowski  
Editorial Board CEM Journal

---

**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani** <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>  
Kepada: "Sebastian Jarzębowski" <cemjournal@gmail.com>

20 Februari 2023 14.23

Dear  
Editor CEM Journal

Thank you for your response. We will be happy to revise the article according to these instructions.

Dedeng Yusuf Maolani  
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia  
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

---

**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani** <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>  
Kepada: "Sebastian Jarzębowski" <cemjournal@gmail.com>

6 Maret 2023 21.20

Dear  
Editor CEM Journal

Thank you for the patience of the CEM Journal Editorial Board. We were waiting for the revision of our article.

We have made improvements according to the reviewer's two instructions. We will be happy if there are still points that need further improvement in the article.

The revised Article is Attached.

Best Regards,

Dedeng Yusuf Maolani  
UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

---

 **Revision2\_CEMJ\_Article\_Dedeng.doc**  
821K



Dedeng Yusuf Maolani &lt;dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id&gt;

---

## ACCEPTANCE LETTER

1 pesan

---

**Sebastian Jarzębowski** <cemjournal@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dedeng Yusuf Maolani <dedeng@uinsgd.ac.id>

24 Maret 2023 12.23

Dear Author(s)  
**Dedeng Yusuf Maolani, Benyamin Harits & Iwan Satibi**

Warm Greetings!

### ACCEPTANCE LETTER

It's a great pleasure to inform your team that after the peer review, your team article entitled "**Collaborative Governance of Hajj Implementation in Indonesia: A Case Study at the Office of the Ministry of Religion in Bandung**" has been **Accepted** for publication in the CEM Journal Regular Issue 2023. Please make a payment publication fee.

Thank you for submitting your teamwork to this journal. We hope to receive it in the future too.

--  
Sebastian Jarzębowski  
Editorial Board CEM Journal

---

 **LoA\_CEMJ\_Dedeng.pdf**  
150K