



Sundanese Sufi and Religious Diversity in the Archipelago: The Pluralistic Vision of Haji Hasan Mustapa (1852-1930)

Jajang A Rohmana¹

Abstract

The paper aims to analyze moderate understanding of Haji Hasan Mustapa on religious diversity in the archipelago. He is a greatest Sundanese poet who has studied in Mecca and served as Hoofd Penghulu of Kotaraja Aceh and Bandung in the colonial era. This study is focused on sufism and religious diversity, Mustapa's scholarship, and on his pluralistic vision, using intertextual studies and semantic analysis. This research argues that Mustapa has tolerance and moderate understanding similarly with Ibn 'Arabi's thought. He uses kernel and husk as symbolic images which expressed using natural richness of Sundanese culture for demonstrating his religious conviction that *rasa* is the kernel of all religions. This study is significant for strengthening the discourse of religious pluralism from sufi perspective in the archipelago which cannot be separated from the chain of Islamic intellectual network. This research has also a significant impact on Chittick's assumption about the depth of sufi poetry which mostly reveal their tolerance views on religious diversity living in harmony.

Keywords: poetry, sufism, Sunda, religious diversity

A. Introduction

The study of sufism and religious pluralism generally tend to be rooted in the idea of sufis in the Middle East. However, scholars have not been expand the issue of religious pluralism in the context of sufism in Nusantara. It is important to explain that the Nusantara sufi cannot be separated from the sufi tradition in Arab and Persia. Ibn 'Arabi and Al-Jili's concept of *wahdat al-wujud* (the unity of being) for example, has a great influence on sufi tradition in Nusantara.²

Therefore, it is important to explore how Nusantara sufis captured the concept of sufi pluralism in Arab and Persia and put it in their religious diversity life in Nusantara. One of Nusantara sufis who has expressed his respond to the religious diversity issue in the colonial era was Haji Hasan Mustapa (1852-1930). He is the greatest Sundanese poet who wrote many works of Sundanese sufi literature.³ He is often regarded as a *'ulama mahiwal* (an eccentric *'ulama*). Sayyid 'Uthman (1822-1914) have been sent a letter of condemnation and accused him of helping the Dutch colonial to convert the Sundanese people.⁴ However, his career as a *Hoofd Penghulu* of Kotaraja Aceh and Bandung made him respected by the Dutch colonial officials, such as K.F. Holle, C. Snouck Hurgronje, Branders, G.A. Hazeu, van Ronkel, Rinkes, and others.⁵ He then become one of colonial partners and informants who supplied a lot of information related to socio-religious life in the Dutch East Indies.⁶ Based on his closeness of the Dutch colonial officials, it can be understood that Mustapa then tried to express his views on religious diversity in his mystical works.

This study attempts to reinforce sufism argument on religious pluralism. Ibn 'Arabi and Al-Jili's concept of *wahdat al-wujud* has affected Mustapa's view on pluralistic vision. It is not only can lead to his recognition of the diversity of the Universe as manifestation of God, but also his belief that there is an inner meaning in all religions which can be called as the basic of unity of religions. This research very significant not only to attract Mustapa's idea in the religious diversity in Indonesia, but also in the context of Sundanese Muslims in West Java who known friendly and obedient.⁷ However, this region lately tend to be assumed as one of center points of radicalism and religious intolerance in Indonesia which its subjects mostly are Sundanese.⁸

B. Sufism and Religious Diversity

The sufism acceptance of religious diversity has long been a topic of heated debate among scholars. Many scholars called it transcendental unity of religions (*wahdat al-adyan*).⁹ al-Hallaj (858-922) is regarded as a pioneer of this concept. He believed that all religions were coming from God. These are different in designation and name. This like a tree. The branch of religions grow from the same root.¹⁰ In addition to al-Hallaj, scholars also mentioned role of *Ikhwan al-Safa* and their works, *Rasa'il*. They are regarded as a mystics group who have openness view to religious diversity. They describe the truth can be found in all scriptures, beliefs, nations and cultures. All of knowledge have sourced from the unity of principle, cause, world and soul. The openness is the core of their "religion."¹¹

However, compared to Al-Hallaj and Ikhwan al-Safa, Ibn 'Arabi (1165-1240) is regarded as a greatest mystics. His influence outstretches far into almost all regions in the Islamic world. His view on religious pluralism has been a heated topic of debate. Ibn 'Arabi argues that God himself is the first problem that makes many differences in this universe from the beginning. The differences is one of many signs that God's mercy takes precedence over His wrath, leading to the ultimate happiness of all creatures. All creatures are manifestation of God's self-disclosure (*tajalli*). God creates the universe to manifest the fullness of His own nature in order to be known. But His manifestation is depending on particular preparedness of individuals in proportion to his/her knowledge capacity. The essence of God is one, but His manifestation in the form of name or symbol is many and varied.¹²

Ibn 'Arabi's concept of *tajalli* describes his axiomatic understanding of religious diversity as a natural consequence of unlimited emanation of God. Therefore, religious diversity is consequence of individual differences who has received His *tajalli* in proportion to his knowledge capacity. Although Ibn 'Arabi never clearly mention the term "unity of religions" (*wahdat al-adyan*), but his explanation about unity of essence has proved this. Through the doctrine of *wahdat al-wujud*, Ibn 'Arabi believes that the essence is one. All differences came and lead to Him. Therefore, the essence of all religions derived from God.¹³ These also will lead to Him. Ibn 'Arabi also a bit much in common with Ibn al-Farid (1181-1235). He is true mystics lovers of Egypt who believes the mystical unity of religions. Based on his love and *fana'* (extinction or annihilation in God), Ibn al-Farid describes that religions is one in essence (*haqiqa*), although these are different name and term literally.¹⁴

The doctrine of Ibn 'Arabi on *wahdat al-wujud* then developed by al-Jili (1365-1421/1428). He also stated the unity of universal logos in essence. Prophets brought one universal aspect of logos into historical logos. It is then making different with each other treatises.¹⁵ Likewise, we cannot ignore Jalaluddin Rumi (1207-1273). His teachings are regarded as a basic argument of religious pluralism. He is a mystic teacher who marked long journey of sufi tradition which well known for round of dervishes. In his great work, *Mathnawi*, Rumi believes that time and space is manifestation of God. The religious diversity have disguised basic unity of religion. Everything unite with love of God.¹⁶ Rumi's teaching has attracted Americans who clearly hungry for spiritual insights no matter where they may come from, illustrated by the fact that the best selling religious book after the Bible is the poetry of this Persian Sufi.¹⁷

The doctrine of unity of being (*wahdat al-wujud*) which spread in Arab and Persia has been developed in Nusantara sufi tradition for a long time. The influence of Ibn 'Arabi and Al-Jili can be read in the teaching of Hamzah Fansuri (d. 1590?) and Shamsuddin al-Sumatra'i (1550?-1630). Both Hamzah and Shamsuddin might be regarded as pioneer of *wahdat al-wujud* in Nusantara.¹⁸ Their teachings have not been widely studied in relation to the doctrine of *wahdat al-wujud* or *wujudiyah* and religious diversity in Nusantara. It is interesting that the critical view of al-Raniri against both Hamzah and Shamsuddin was reflected in *Hujjah al-Siddiq li Daf' al-Zindiq* dan *Al-Tibyan fi Ma'rifah al-Adyan*. Raniri's works can be regarded as a point of departure to study of Hamzah and Shamsuddin in the discourse of religious pluralism in Nusantara.¹⁹ It is important to analyze the influence of Ibn 'Arabi's *wahdat al-wujud* to Hamzah and Shamsuddin, in the context of their views of religious diversity in Nusantara. Haji Hasan Mustapa can be regarded as one of pluralist mystics. He has been influenced by sufism ideas of Ibn 'Arabi and Al-Jili. Mustapa's mystical expressions in the form of *dangding* or *guguritan* indicate his openness view of religious diversity.

C. The Pluralistic Vision of Haji Hasan Mustapa

Mystical view of Mustapa on religious diversity was based on three important things: his general view of the manifestation of God in the Universe, symbolic images of kernel and husk and his belief in what he called as *agama rasa* (religion of sense or inner meaning). His view generally is compatible with mystical view of Ibn 'Arabi and other pluralist mystics. However, the peculiarities of Mustapa is based on his use of symbolic images. He uses symbolic images of Sundanese nature which expressed in metrical poetry as its container.

1. The Plurality of God's Manifestation

The thought of Mustapa on diversity of being cannot be separated from the doctrine of *wahdat al-wujud*. The doctrine was developed by Ibn 'Arabi and al-Jili. It is interesting that the doctrine then was developed by al-Burhanfuri (1545-1620) into the theory of seven grade of being or *martabat tujuh*.²⁰ The theory of *martabat tujuh* was widely followed by various streams of sufi orders in Nusantara. Mustapa has referred the doctrine of *wahdat al-wujud* and *martabat tujuh* to the tradition of Shattariya orders which connected with Sheikh Abdul Muhyi (1640-1715).²¹

The theory of *martabat tujuh* was used to solve philosophical problem of the relation between the Absolute and the relative, the One and the

many, God and His creatures. The follower of philosophical sufism propose the theory of manifestation of God or *tajalli*. The theory believes that all creations derive from the manifestation of God. God created His creatures as an object of His love. His creatures were not created from nothing, but they were created through determination of God's attribute to His essence. Thus, then God can create various kinds of creatures as His manifestation. The manifestation occurs through a hierarchy of being that consists of seven levels of being so-called *martabat tujuh* (*maratib al-sab'* or *martabatpitu*): *ahadiyat, wahdat, wahidiyat, 'alam arwah*, *'alam mithal, 'alam ajsam, dan insan kamil*).²⁴

<i>Yahu dat wajibul wujud</i>	O who he is a substance of absolute being
<i>Gusti aing nu sajati</i>	My true Lord
<i>jangkar pangwedalan</i>	A source of the manifestation of sense
<i>rasa</i>	An essence of the source of heart
<i>beuti pangbijilan ati</i>	It was hindering now
<i>ayeuna geus katuruban</i>	By my self
<i>ku aya aing pribadi</i>	

<i>Sacatur wajibul wujud</i>	He was called as <i>wajib al-wujud</i>
<i>Gusti hiji teu ngabukti</i>	God is one who is not proven
<i>ana bray ligar ti nyawa</i>	(but) so open, (He) falls in my soul
<i>aya bumi aya langit</i>	There is earth and heaven
<i>aya ligar mancawarna</i>	There is a variety of colors downfall
<i>pipinding Gusti sahiji</i> ²²	It hinders the God's one

<i>Abdina rasaning tilu</i>	The servant feel three
<i>Gustina rasaning hiji</i>	God feel one
<i>abdina rasaning warna</i>	The servant feel multicolored
<i>Gustina rasaning hiji</i>	God feel one
<i>nu salah ngarujak eta</i>	It is wrong who has mixed it
<i>leungit kagustian diri</i> ²³	Then lost divinity of self

Therefore, it can be said that the plurality of mankind and the Universe was derived from the diversity of God's manifestation (*tajalli*) in

the cosmos since the beginning.²⁵ The difference of manifestation is one of many signs that all creatures will be in God's blessing. All creatures are the manifestation of God. He was known through His manifestation, but His manifestation are dependent on readiness of each creature in proportion of their knowledge. God is one in essence, but His manifestation in the form of symbol or name is unlimited. However, although His name was plural, but basically these are same in language. God as the creator for example, was known as a name of God in all religions. It can be used as a basic argument for a dialogue of religions.²⁶

However, the plurality of His symbol and name in the universe have caused God has hindered from His creations. He is an absolute being or *wajib a-wujud* who has hindered by the relativity of His creatures. Man has to attempt to pass over the relativity of his name after his creation in the world. He has to find source of his authenticity where he was created in the beginning. Mustapa describes in his *dangding* of *Kinanti Jung Indit deui ti Bandung dan Kinanti nu Pengkuh di Alam Tuhu*:

Mustapa, as well as Ibn 'Arabi, realized that when human was created, he was in the nature of differences. He felt multicolored. It is a difference between him and God. Therefore, he then continually attempts to beyond his difference until reaches God who is source of himself. Mustapa called it *nepi ka urut indit* (arriving to the point of departing). It can be understood because Mustapa believes that the difference is a consequence of manifestation of God. His manifestations are difference in their realities of creation, but it is one in essence of original source. All essences are one. All differences be based on Him. God is a source of all differences. The differences are in the area of husk, because their essences and original sources are one. Based on his conception of the husk and kernel, Mustapa then describes many symbols of both which borrowed from Sundanese culture and nature.

2. The Symbol of Kernel and Husk

Symbolic images of kernel and husk are used by Mustapa to explains God and Man relations. He believes that Man and the universe are His creatures and regarded as everything other than God. His creatures does not only physical things but also spiritual things. This like kernel and husk. The kernel represents the invisible realm, which domain of divinity aspects (*lahut*), souls, spirits and angels; the husk represents the human aspects (*nasut*), visible realm, which domain of sense perception and bodily things. If we look at the universe in relation to God, God is the kernel, and the universe is the husk. In other words, relative to God, both spirits and

bodies are husks. But, if we look at the universe in relation to our own human embodiment, then the physical realm is the husk, the spiritual realm is the kernel, and God is the kernel of the kernel.²⁷

Mustapa describes these both realm with varieties of symbolic images. In contrast to the Arab and Persian mystics, he describes it with Sundanese symbolic images. Mustapa follows Ibn 'Arabi who often used symbolic images that evoke emergent associations rather than fixed propositions.²⁸ He uses Sundanese metrical verse or *dangding* as its container. It is a creation of Sundanese sufi literature to celebrates his search of the self authenticity. Mustapa for example, describes symbolic images of kernel and husk or God and himself in one of his poems, *Kinanti Kidung Pucuk Méga Mendung*:

<i>Ti tadi caraluk kawung</i>	It is palm sugar fruit from earlier
<i>ti tadi salumpit awi</i>	It is <i>salumpit</i> of bamboo from earlier
<i>ti tadi tongtolang nangka</i>	It is <i>tongtolang</i> of jackfruit from earlier
<i>ti tadi kembang malati</i>	It is a jasmine from earlier
<i>ti tadi hidayatullah</i>	It is God's guidance from earlier
<i>ti tadi pastining diri</i>	It is certainty of self from earlier

<i>Puguh caruluk sakawung</i>	Sure, <i>caruluk sakawung</i>
<i>puguh salumpit saawi</i>	Sure, <i>salumpit saawi</i>
<i>puguh tongtolang sanangka</i>	Sure, <i>tongtolang sanangka</i>
<i>jarami sarumpak jami</i>	It is straw after harvesting time
<i>pandan ngora dipaudan</i>	Young pandanus was washed
<i>dijieun samak salipi</i>	And made <i>kaneron</i> mat

<i>Rarambu tunggal rarambu</i>	Unity of side part
<i>salipi tunggal salipi</i>	Unity of <i>salipi</i>
<i>lambaran sapapandangan</i>	A sheet of same pandanus
<i>tunggal kaulaning Gusti</i>	United God and His servant
<i>tunggal kaulaning sukma</i>	United soul of the servant
<i>rapih sasamaning ngabdi</i> ²⁹	It is neat as same as a servant

Mustapa in his poetry make a different between God and Man in the context of *wahdat al-awujud*. It is an image of meeting between kernel and

husk, *nasut* and *lahut*, human and divinity aspects. Mustapa expressed it through symbolical images of *caruluk* (palm sugar fruit) and *kawung* (palm tree), *salumpit* (dry layer which circling on bamboo tree) and bamboo, *tongtolang* (young jackfruit) and jackfruit, straw dan *jami* (straw after harvesting time), pandanus leave and *samak salipi* (mats, kaneron, bags, sacks).³⁰ The other sufis may be described it with day and night, drunkenness and consciousness, sun and light, boat and sea, wine and glasses, etc.

Mustapa celebrated his effort to achieve the self authenticity through his poetry. He uses Sundane metrical verse or *dangding*. A literary work had been earlier been used to arranged Sundanese tembang with stringed instrument. It is not just read silently. Although the expression of poetic and mystical experiences tend to be different, but both are met in use of symbols. Symbolic images are medium of delivering subtle message of emotions that cannot be understood rationally. Therefore, according to sufis, poetry is a medium in which they could do the best of their capacities. They sing and celebrate it. Chittick called sufi poetry a celebration of love, a hymn of unity and unification, a cheerful song that invites listener to feel the eternal wine.³¹

Mustapa's *dangding* is similar to Arab sufi poetry such as al-Hallaj, Ibn 'Arabi, al-Sa'di, Ibn Farid, as well as Persian and Turkey such as Attar and Rumi, and many sufis in other areas.³² His poetry express the same mystical spiritual feeling. Similarly, the Malay shair of Hamzah and Javanese mysticism literature are demonstrating the influence of sufism narrative which expressed in regional languages in Nusantara.³³ Sufi poetry represents mystical spiritual feeling which experienced by anyone who closed to God. Therefore, it right to say that the poets were the chief disseminators of sufi thought.³⁴ Throughout the ages, poets and mystics of all nations have perhaps had one fundamental problem in common and that is, how to express the inexpressable; how to speak the unspeakable.³⁵

Poetry can represent various meanings deeply through symbolic images. It just shows the word, without explanation. Poetry has magical power of beautiful language, draw many images and rhythm of love.³⁶ Poetry is created in ecstasy. Hence, it existed in the kernel area, not husk. This is different from the prose. According to sufis, prose is generally used to write about Islamic teaching and ethics. The prose describes God in the description of good, ritual obligations, and guidance of normative behavior. It is more closer to husk.

Suluk is search process from husk to kernel, from *nasut* to *lahut*. It is return process of the self to arriving at the point of departing. This like a

cycle. Suluk as a way of sufism attempts to overcome the tension between kernel and husk to attain the kernel of the kernel (God). Man cannot attain his authenticity in the husk area. He had to arise his potential divinity. Everything could be put in its proper place if Man can find his own kernel and increase to the kernel of the kernel.

Perfect Man is full image of the hidden secret of God (*al-insan sirri, wa ana sirruhu*). Man was created in accordance with all kernels of divinity, both spirit (kernel) and body (husk). It is only Man who can attain the kernel of the kernel (God), the spirit of the spirit. Man derived from God and must return to God. He has to making re-unification of his existence with God (*wahdat al-wujud*) and to emitting pearl hidden in His existence in the world (*kanzanmakhfiyyan*), demonstrating His greatness, and carry out the divine attributes. His will has to unite with the will of God. This is a search of divinity aspects (*lahut*) in human aspects (*nasut*). It is like a paradoxical logic between kernel and husk, between form and essence. There is human aspects in divinity and divinity aspects in human.³⁷

No.	Kernel	Husk	Meaning of Symbols
1.	<i>Kuring</i> /I	<i>Kurung</i> /Container	There is self authenticity which shut in your self body.
3.	<i>Aing</i> /I	<i>Anjeun</i> /You	There are human and divinity aspects in human body which have to be united.
4.	<i>Jantung</i> /heart	<i>Cau</i> /banana	Man has to find his authenticity until its heart or kernel.
5.	<i>Buruy</i> /tadpole	<i>Bangkong</i> /frog	Search process of authenticity is not easy.
6.	<i>Angklung</i>	<i>Awi</i> /Bamboo	The beautiful rhythm of authenticity would be achieved when the holy of self met with the Most Holy of God.
7.	<i>Haur</i> /a kind of bamboo	<i>Awi</i> / Bamboo	The authenticity of self can be achieved when the self has changed from the ordinary level (<i>'awam</i>) to the elite level (<i>khawas</i>).

8.	<i>Iwung</i> /bamboo shoot	<i>Awi</i> / Bamboo	The authenticity of self can be achieved when arriving at the point of departing.
9.	<i>Kawung</i> /palm tree	<i>Caruluk</i> /palm fruit	
10.	<i>Nangka</i> /jackfruit	<i>Tongtolang</i> /young jackfruit	
11.	<i>Endog</i> /egg	<i>Hayam</i> /chicken	
12.	<i>Kitri</i> /seed of coconut	<i>Dewegan</i> /young coconut	
13.	<i>Béas</i> /rice	<i>Paré</i> /rice plant	
14.	<i>Sirung</i> /shoot	<i>Binih</i> /sheed	
15.	<i>Lancah</i> /spider	<i>Ramat</i> /web	
16.	<i>Kidul</i> /south	<i>Kalér</i> /north	
17.	<i>Wétan</i> /east	<i>Kulon</i> /west	
18.	<i>Malati</i> /jasmine	<i>Kembang</i> /flower	
19.	etc.		

Mystical thought of Mustapa tend to emphasizes what is called as a sufism of reconciliative. He believes that the hidden mystery of God can only be known through His creation. We can also find this in mystical thought of Hamzah Fansuri.³⁸ Mustapa used symbol images which distinguish between himself and God despite both are identical and cannot be separated. He, in same manner as Ibn 'Arabi, still emphasizes that God and the Universe are identical and different as well. He emphasizes the immanence (*tashbih*) and transcendence (*tanzih*) of God.³⁹ Following table shows how Mustapa used symbol images of kernel and husk in his *dangding* which borrowed from Sundanese nature and culture.

Mustapa used various symbol of kernel and husk which rooted in God's attributes and works. God created kernel and husk, spiritual things and physical things. Man have soul and body. Both need to be maintained and trained continually. God sent prophets to provide guidance in developing it. The prophets bring a variety of practices, rituals, rules and laws to maintain the body and social life in community. They bring wisdom and enlightenment to cultivate the spirit. Various traditions of knowledge in Islam are also referred to these two areas. The knowledge of theological dogma, ritual and social practices are contained in the husk area. Sufis teachings encourage the kernel dimension.

The theology of Islam also describes God in these two bipolar: beauty name (*ism jamal*) and majesty name (*ism jalal*) of God, which in Chinese

tradition called as *yin* and *yang*.⁴⁰ God was merciful and arrogant, gentle and hard, or in more abstract terms, he was *tashbih* and *tanzih*, immanent and transcendent. According to Mustapa, drama of human life existed in a tension between the bipolarity of kernel and husk which embodied in both immanence and transcendence of God. That bipolarity sing his immanence and transcendence, his merciful and wrath, drunkenness and consciousness, unification and separation which using symbolic images of *carulukkawung*, *salumpitawi*, *tongtolang nangka*, *kembang malati*. *Salik* will accept anything that comes from God, whether unification or separation. Mustapa in his poetry celebrates both, *caruluk* and *kawung* were celebrated together. His poetry like a hymn of unity and unification of the kernel and husk. There are no place to divide anything, but this simply to proud in the universal presence of God who has united all elements into the same origins.⁴¹

In sufi tradition, the kernel is essentially light, life, knowledge and awareness; the husk is essentially darkness, death, ignorance and unconsciousness. The kernel is meaning, the husk is expression and form. The kernel is the domain of unity, sameness, coherence, peace and harmony; the husk is the domain of multiplicity, difference, incoherence, strife and disharmony.

Therefore, it can be understood if sufis tend to easily accept religious diversity. They see the diversity in the context of God's mercy comprehensively. His mercy precedes His wrath (*rahmati yaghlil ghadabi*) as Muhammad said.⁴² This seems to be happen, because His mercy shows the unity of God's reality, meanwhile His wrath appears only in terms of diversity of creation. God's mercy, gentleness and His merciful are more real and fundamental to the divine attributes than His wrath and violence. God's mercy be obtained in His essence as the one, meanwhile God's wrath only appear in His manifestation after various distinctions was made between various names and attributes of God. Sufi poets generally believed this. There are no final judgment on someone. The final judgment only belongs to God, and He sees on his best time. This according to God's evaluation, not ours. The only thing that we can be sure of is the unity of God and God's mercy presedes His wrath.

Sufis invite all creations to return to the mercy of God. This does not mean that sufi poets like Mustapa be liberal, pluralist, tolerant, even relativist in the modern sense. Sufis celebrate the unity of kernel as well as differences and conflicts that exist on the husk. No one could find the kernel, which an area of peace, harmony, sincerity and generosity, without the husk. This means that God's wrath and anger have a real manifestation

in human life. They are fully aware that no one can get the kernel without the husk which being handled well. They know that this requires the guidance of God as revealed to the prophets. According to sufis, there is no contradiction between pluralism and exclusivism, absolutism and relativism. There is similar element of all religions, but the believer would believe the truth of his own religion.⁴³ Pluralism only existed in the kernel and exclusivism existed in the husk. Sufis pluralism believe that there is unity of all mankind in the creative act of God. This is recognized unanimously by all the prophets.

3. Inner Dimension of all Religions

The symbolic images of kernel and husk in mystical thought of Mustapa, carrying him on the inner dimension that unite all religions. According to him, the diversity of creatures are coming from the shape of physical. It can be said that when Man penetrate into inner dimension, they will find the peace. The inner dimension is regarded as religious basic. This representates the kernel, similarities and peace. This innate of Man spirit and soul. All religions emphasize the teaching of inner dimension of divinity aspects. Schuon and Nasr call it esotericism of religion or unity of religious transcendence.⁴⁴ Mustapa calls it “*agamarasa*” (religion of sense).

Mustapa describes that the inner dimension of religions converge on what he calls as a search process of self extinction or annihilation in God (*nyiar fana*). He just follows the sign of his inner meaning which flowing until his sense. Mustapa expressed it in *Asmarandana Ngagurit Kaburu Burit* (Or. 7876):

<i>Pangrasa ti barang lilir</i>	My feeling since I am adult
<i>Sugriya bangsaning jalma</i>	That every human
<i>Teu pilih agama naon</i>	Whatever their religions
<i>Leungit mukti, nyiar fana</i>	Missing their adequacy, looking for annihilation
<i>Leungit Allah, nyiar betah</i>	in God
<i>Tepi katutug lagedu</i>	Missing God, looking for immortality
<i>Taya piubareunana</i>	Until finish, perfect
	There is no longer a cure
<i>Piubareunana tadi</i>	The cure that had been used
<i>Diwarah rasa nyorangan</i>	This is educated by his alone feeling
<i>Kunaonna teu katembong</i>	The caused cannot be apperared
<i>Jalan warta papaiyan</i>	Following,flowing news
<i>Nepi terusing rasa</i>	Until to the sense

Nepi ka nyuruh ka bayu Until having rhythm with the wind
*Jatnika ludeunganana*⁴⁵ It is true courage

Mustapa describes in his poetry that spiritual experience of the people who are aware of their existences will lead to search process of self annihilation in God. The self-consciousness that seeks to unite with God. This reminds us to one of the major themes of sufism on the universality of inner meaning that connects all religions.⁴⁶ According to Mustapa, all religious experiences culminate in search process of self annihilation in God. God's name no longer exist, because there is only a comfort feeling in perfect immortality that still exists.

According to Mustapa, it is not easy to achieve the self annihilation perfectly. He has to burn his self profanity. Mustapa calls it *nepi katutug lagedu*. The word of *lagedu* (skin when be blackening) is a symbol that means an effort of hard work to burn his self profanity until finish perfectly. His self perfection was marked by a symbol of black skin which caused by the ray of sun.⁴⁷ The effort of annihilation can be achieved through following the sign of inner meaning in his sense. The phrase of *nepi katutug lagedu* is a proper expression to describes the end of spiritual process in Sundanese. The phrase is an expression of what Corbyn called as a creative imagination in Mustapa's *dangding*.⁴⁸

It is interesting that one of mystical thoughts of Mustapa focuses on inner dimension of religions. Mustapa also emphasizes it in his poetry *Kinanti nu Pengkuh di Alam Tuju*. He describes that all creatures are different in the external dimension; on the contrary, all creatures are same in the inner dimension.

Bukurna béda jeung batur His proof is different from others
lahirna béda jeung lahir His external dimension is different
rasana béda jeung rasa His sense is different
atina béda jeung ati His heart is different
tatana béda jeung tata His attitude is different
budina béda jeung budi His kindness is different

Tah kitu alaming mahluk That is a nature of creature
tah kitu alaming abdi That is a nature of me
tah kitu alaming dunya That is a nature of world

<i>tah kitu alaming jisim</i>	That is a nature of body
<i>tah kitu alaming désa</i>	That is a nature of village
<i>tah kitu alaming sisi</i>	That is a nature of side
<i>Bukur teu béda jeung bukur</i>	Evidence is not different with another evidence
<i>lahir teu béda jeung lahir</i>	External dimension is not different
<i>rasa teu béda jeung rasa</i>	Sense is not different
<i>ati teu béda jeung ati</i>	Heart is not different
<i>tata teu béda jeung tata</i>	Attitude is not different
<i>budi teu béda jeung budi</i>	Kindness is not different
<i>Tah kitu alaming tuhu</i>	That is a nature of loyalty
<i>tah kitu alaming Gusti</i>	That is a nature of God
<i>tah kitu alam aherat</i>	That is a nature of hereafter
<i>tah kitu alaming batin</i>	That is a nature of inner meaning
<i>tah kitu alaming sirna</i>	That is a nature of annihilation
<i>tah kitu alaming pasti</i>	That is a nature of absolute
<i>Nu itu geusan di hirup</i>	That is it, its place in life
<i>nu ieu geusan di hirup</i>	That is it, its place in real life
<i>nu itu geusan di basa</i>	That is it, its place in language
<i>nu ieu geusan di eusi</i>	That is it, its place in essence
<i>nu itu geusan keur ngora</i>	That is it, its place when was young
<i>nu ieu keur aki-aki</i>	This is it, when was old
<i>Béda-bédana di itu</i>	Its different in that matter
<i>nya cau béda jeung cai</i>	Banana and water are different
<i>nya gula béda jeung uyah</i>	Sugar and salt are different
<i>nya panas béda jeung tiis</i>	Heat and cold are different
<i>nya bulan béda jeung</i>	Moon and stars are different
<i>béntang</i>	Earth and sky are different
<i>nya bumi béda jeung langit</i>	
<i>Nya handap béda jeung</i>	Underside and above side are different
<i>luhur</i>	<i>Gusti</i> and his servant are different

<i>nya Gusti béda jeung abdi</i>	Allah and Muhammad are different
<i>Allah béda jeung</i>	Literal and inner meaning are different
<i>Muhammad</i>	The world and the hereafter are different
<i>nya lahir béda jeung batin</i>	The beginning and the end are different
<i>dunya béda jeung ahérat</i>	
<i>nya awal béda jeung ahir</i>	
<i>//Da ieu mah lain kitu</i>	Because this is not like that
<i>nya cau tunggaling cai</i>	Banana united with water
<i>nya gula tunggaling uyah</i>	Sugar united with salt
<i>nya panas tunggaling tiis</i>	Heat united with cold
<i>nya bulan tunggaling</i>	Moon united with stars
<i>béntang</i>	Earth united with sky
<i>nya bumi tunggaling langit</i>	
<i>Nya handap tunggaling</i>	The underside united with the above
<i>luhur</i>	side
<i>nya Gusti tunggaling abdi</i>	Gusti united with his servant
<i>Allah tunggaling</i>	Allah united with Muhammad
<i>Muhammad</i>	The external dimension united with the
<i>nya lahir tunggaling batin</i>	inner meaning
<i>dunya tunggaling ahérat</i>	The world united with the hereafter
<i>nya awal tunggaling ahir</i>	The beginning united with the end
<i>Bédana jaizul wujud</i>	It is different of <i>ja'izul wujud</i>
<i>tunggalna barina wajib</i>	Its unity is obligated
<i>wajib sadatna-sadatna</i>	Its obligatory is only an essence
<i>jaizna nu lain-lain</i>	Its <i>ja'iz</i> is the others
<i>wenangna saluar datna</i>	It might be in external essence
<i>wajibna sadating diri</i> ⁴⁹	Its obligatory of a self essence

Mustapa illustrates that all realities are different in the nature of creation or external dimension; but these are same in the nature of God or inner meaning. The phrase of Mustapa reminds us of the ideas of Ibn 'Arabi. He said that the reality is one in essence. The nature of external

dimension is different, but its different referred to God. God is the first problem that makes the difference in this universe from the beginning.

All creatures is manifestation of God's self-disclosure (*tajalli*). God, as a hidden mystery, manifested His self through his creation. Hence, He then was known (*kuntu kanzan makhfiyyan fakhalaqtu alkhalq liya'rifuni*). However, His manifestation is depending on particular preparedness and presupposition of individuals in proportion to his/her knowledge capacity (*ana 'inda zann 'abdi bi*). The essence of God is one, but His manifestation is many and varied.⁵⁰

The symbol and name of religions are part of diversity in the external dimension. It is a natural consequence of the unlimited emanation and manifestation of God. Every religion is different, but the difference is not absolute. All religions are one in essence and connected each other. Mustapa argued in one of his works that there are similarities between Buddhism and Islam in essence:

88. Question: "If the religion (of Islam) does not come here (in West Java), the holy Qur'an does not come here, the Prophet, the custodian, the believer story does not convey, Islamic faith does not come here, no story on that... the Sundanese people may will be Buddhism. They do not know the truth of religion (Islam)?

Answer: Well, this does not like that, because all religions are innate of Man soul. Every soul has religion, because Man is (more better) than animals. There are some talks in human daily life which more greater their animal lusts. They leave his religion. They can find a true religion when their lusts can be controlled.⁵¹

It is interesting that Mustapa in his book of question and answer, no longer focused on the external dimension of religion which always see the others in different. Mustapa has also look at the religion in essence (*gnosis, ma'rifat*). All religions is difference, but these are united in essence.⁵² Islam, a religion which comes to West Java after Buddhism, were not be celebrated as only one truth. Islam is not only one truth mission. The Sundanese people have followed Buddhism previously. Both Islam and Buddhism have similar missions in essence. They have followed a religion before Islam. This can be said that all religions are innate of human soul. Hence, every human basically have religion. According to Mustapa, the religious differences were caused by animal lusts of human. Their lusts influenced Man ability to accept the truth of religion. Their lusts can make all religions more colored. There are not only softness and openness in all religions, but also hardness and closedness. These colored dimension would make religions in conflict.

However, every human will be able to talk about the kernel of truth if their lusts can be controlled. They will be clear when talking about the truth of religion.

Mustapa also referred to the lust of human when in other part of his book he was asked about the root of disputes and conflicts among human. The lust of human which regarded as lower grade. Mustapa described it with symbol of *kaula* (servant) and *cacah* (lower people). According to him, their employers or lord (*Gusti*) did not intervene in the dispute of his servant. Furthermore, Mustapa has also answered that he never been fight anyone, although there are people who invite him to fight. This answer shows that Mustapa loved to each other by his inner meaning and heart.

108. Question: "Why do people like to dispute?" Answer: "That is happen between low people and their fellows, fellow servants. They tempted together; their lords did not intervene!"

109. Question: "Have you ever been to fight with someone?" Answer: I have never invite someone to fight! I often invited to fight by someone, they think that I will fight him.⁵³

Furthermore, Mustapa also has been asked about the meaning of religion. He said that all religions educate and learn about the inner meaning. It like a Sundanese proverb: there are something sounds, looks and feels by yourself (*aya ka nu kadeuleu kadéngé, aya nu karasa ku manéh*). Therefore, Islam taught the doctrin of twenty attributes of God as a basic lesson to learn about the inner meaning. Based on the lesson, moslems could feel the presence of God in their hearts:

89. Question: "What is the true meaning of religion? For what?"

Answer: the religion, all religions, educate and learn to move (to the sense); as a proverb said, "*ninggang terusing rasa*" (its goal to achieve the sense or inner meaning); It like another proverb: "there are something sounds, looks and feels by yourself (*nyebut aya ka nu kadeuleu kadéngé*)."⁵⁴ The religion learn you that there is something which feels to you (*aya nu karasa ku manéh*). Therefore, you learn about twenty attributes of God first, because it is important to your heart or inner meaning. Someday when you talking about being of God, it will be different with your daily talk.⁵⁴

Mustapa holds this religion of sense firmly. His convince on the inner meaning of religion was also expressed in his letter to Snouck. He said that the scriptures of divine religions are result of faith (*iman*), not Islam.

“My last work is *Dawalib al‘Awalim*, entitled *Gurinda Alam Dunya Karang Kembang Haji Hasan Mustapa*. There are three volumes. Its content is about many terms and customs which changing along with the different of time and space in religion and culture ... the others explained that the scriptures of divine religions are result of faith, not Islamic.⁵⁵

Mustapa explicitly explains that the scriptures of divine religions are result of faith and creed (*iman*). He does not attempt to doubt all scriptures, because according to him, all scriptures are result of faith. It is a result of inner meaning of the prophets. Although the prophets and their religions are different historically, but their teachings are same in essence. The religious diversity which brought by the prophets is a direct consequence of the differences of each prophet to receive God’s manifestation (*tajalli*) in proportion their capacity. Every religion is different in historical logos, but the difference was not absolute, because the universal logos is one in essence. This is the essence of religions, namely the religion of sense.

In other metrical poetry, Mustapa stated that we will not be able to achieve the religious truth in the world. There are many people bow down to wood or stone. They often betray God. Therefore, Mustapa choosed the path of Ibrahim. However, this depends on the choice of their own passions for binding promise with their self authenticities. Mustapa attempts to embrace all religions, though his choice on the path of Ibrahim. He has a lot of interaction with non-Muslim, particularly the colonial officials. So he attempts to find a common religious conviction. He believes that the truth of religion cannot be found in this world, in the nature of external meaning. Because the religious choices will be depend on every human lust and passion. The true religion is exist in the kernel of inner meaning.

<i>Piit ngeundeuk-ngeundeuk pasir</i>	The sparrows shake up the hill
<i>jogjog neureuy buah lowa</i>	Jogjog swallowed lowa fruit
<i>wawanén tonggeret banén</i>	It is a courage of <i>tonggeretbanen</i>
<i>néangan nu enya-nya</i>	They are looking for the real
<i>nya moal meunang di dunya</i>	It cannot be achieved in the world
<i>nya sujud ka kayu watu</i>	They bowed to wood to stone
<i>turnan wisaya berahma</i>	Because they follow God’s way

<i>Berahmana ngan Ibrohim</i>	It is only the divinity path of Ibrahim
<i>minangka jalan agama</i>	As a religious path

<i>mana baé naon baé</i>	Anywhere anything
<i>nu jadi jalan agama</i>	The path of religion
<i>agama unggal agama</i>	Every religion
<i>mana kitu ogé napsu</i>	It is also maybe a lust
<i>subaya kanapsiyahan</i> ⁵⁶	To bind a promise of self authenticity

Therefore, Mustapa does not hold the dichotomy between *iman* and *kufur*, believe and unbelieve, moslem or infidel. According to him, this issue is a spiritual discussion, not Islamic jurisprudence area (*fiqh*). This issue is only exist in inner meaning and sense. Mustapa always take a position in this spiritual circle, the nature of angel (*malakut*) and divinity aspects (*lahut*). In his polemical work, *Injaz al-Wa'd fi Itfa' a-Ra'd* (to fulfill a promise and to stopped up the thunder), Mustapa expressed his believe on the issue of his position as a moslem or infidel. His work is written as a protest to Sayyid 'Uthman, an 'ulama of Betawi, who has called Mustapa "Evil of Bandung."⁵⁷

The problem of *iman* and *kufur*, believe and unbelieve reside in the spiritual discussion. It is not to be compared that a moslem was born by moslem and an infidel can only bear infidel. The spirit of someone who wrote this writing (Mustapa) is not leave from the spiritual circle. He rotated in there. He could not get out of the spiritual area. His spiritual experience continually move toward the high nature of angel and the great nature of divinity.⁵⁸

With the above discussions, Mustapa clearly demonstrated the attitude of his openness to the religious diversity. His pluralistic vision is based on the inner meaning aspect as the kernel of religions. According to Mustapa, the difference of creatures were derived from their external form, not the inner meaning. The sign of inner meaning in all religions are flowing until his sense. He holds the inner meaning in his heart of religion. He found peace there.

The pluralistic vision of Mustapa, in the context of religious studies, simply have compatibility with the "sophia perennis" of Schuon. A concept which refers to esotericism of religions. Hossein Nasr, who representing a moslem, adopted the sophia perennis concept. Nasr then developes the concept based on his knowledge about sufi master teachings, especially Ibn 'Arabi, Al-Jili and Rumi. The pluralistic vision of Mustapa seems to be in line of the sufis. It is interesting that Mustapa expressed his pluralistic vision through the channel of Sundanese sufi literature. He used many

symbols of Sundanese nature and culture. It is a sufism interpretation that could be called as a transethnic sufism.

E. Closing Remarks

The above discussion provides us that Mustapa captured the concept of sufi pluralism in Arab and Persia and put it in his religious diversity life in West Java. He cannot be separated from the influence of pluralistic vision of previous sufis, such as Ibn 'Arabi and Al-Jili. He expressed his pluralistic vision of religions in Sundanese nature and culture. Mustapa uses the kernel and husk as symbolic images of the relationship between God and Man. Both symbol of kernel and husk are expressed by borrowing natural richness of Sundanese culture. This shows his religious conviction that *rasa* or inner meaning is a kernel of all religions. Mystical thought of Mustapa reflects and celebrates the similarities. All human have to appear the similarities as a common religious conviction towards living in harmony. This study is significant for strengthening the discourse of religious pluralism from sufi perspective. The pluralistic vision of Mustapa demonstrated the similar vision with other sufis. It is important to underlined that the philosophical sufism can lead to the development of a pluralistic vision of religion. Mustapa's position is very important in the discourse of religious pluralism in Nusantara.

Endnotes:

¹ UIN Sunan Gunung Jati Bandung

² A.H. Johns, *The Gift Adressed to the Spirit of the Prophet* (Canberra: Center of Oriental Studies A.N.U, 1965), p. 8; Yunasril Ali, *Manusia Citra Ilahi, Pengembangan Konsep Insan Kamil Ibn 'Arabi oleh al-Jili* (Jakarta: Paramadina, 1997), p. 183.

³ Jajang A Rohmana, 'Sundanese Sufi Literature and Local Islamic Identity: A Contribution of Haji Hasan Mustapa's Dandang.' *Journal Al-Jamiah*, Vol. 50, No. 2, 2012: 303-327.

⁴ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Injaz al-Wa'd fi Itfa' al-Ra'd*, Cod. Or. 7205. UB Leiden University; Nico J.G. Kaptein, *Islam, Colonialism and the Modern Age in the Netherlands East Indies: A Biography of Sayyid 'Uthman (1822-1914)* (Leiden: Brill, 2014), p. 191-192.

⁵ Ajip Rosidi, *Haji Hasan Mustapa jeung Karya-karyana* (Bandung: Pustaka, 1989), p. 49. On the Dutch colonial officials, see Karel A. Steenbrink, *Kawan dalam Pertikaian, Kaum Kolonial Belanda dan Islam di Indonesia (1596-1942)*, translated by Suryan A. Jamrah (Bandung: Mizan, 1995), p. 120-126.

⁶Michael Francis Laffan, *Islamic Nationhood and Colonial Indonesia, The Umma below the Winds* (London-New York: Routledge Curzon, 2003), p. 82-84; Jajat Burhanudin, *Islamic Knowledge, Authority and Political Power: The 'Ulama in Colonial Indonesia* (Leiden University, 2007), p. 109; P.Sj. van Koningsveld, *Snouck Hurgronje dan Islam, Delapan Karangan tentang Hidup dan Karya Seorang Orientalis Zaman Kolonial* (Bandung: Girimukti Pasaka, 1989), p. 162.

⁷ Lynda Newland, "Under the Banner of Islam: Mobilising Religious Identities in West Java," *The Australian Journal of Anthropology*, 2000, 11: 2, p. 203.

⁸ Sukawarsini Djelantik, "Terrorism in Indonesia: The Emergence of West Javanese Terrorist," The paper was presented at the 5th East-West Center International Graduate Student Conference, February 16-18, 2006 in Honolulu, Hawaii USA, p. 11.

⁹ Seyyed Hossein Nasr, *The Garden of Truth: The Vision and Promise of Sufism, Islam's Mystical Tradition* (New York: Harper One, 2007), p. 44.

¹⁰ Louis Massignon, '*Alam al-Hallaj: Shahid al-Tasawwuf al-Islami*, translated by Al-Hussain Mustafa Hallaj (Damaskus: Shirkah Qadmus li al-Nashr wa al-Ta'uzi', 2004), p. 190-191.

¹¹ Ian Richard Netton, *Muslim Neoplatonists: An Introduction to the Thought of the Brethren of Purity (Ikhwan al-Safa)* (London: Routledge Curzon, 2002), p. 7.

¹² Media Zainul Bahri, "Ibn 'Arabi and the Trancendental Unity of Religions," *Al-Jami'ah*, vol. 50, No. 2, 2012, p. 464.

¹³ William C. Chittick, *Imaginal Worlds, Ibn al-'Arabi and the Problem of Religious Diversity* (Albany: State University of New York, 1994), p. 139-140; Henry Corbin, *Alone with the Alone, Creative Imagination in the Sufism of Ibn 'Arabi* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969), p. 232.

¹⁴ Th. Emil Homerin, *From Arab Poet to Muslim Saint: Ibn al-Farid His Verse and His Shrine* (Cairo and New York: The American University in Cairo Press, 2001), p. 29 and 63.

¹⁵ Al-Jili, *Al-Insan al-Kamil fi Ma'rifah al-Awa'il wa al-Awakhir*, vol. 1 (Mishr: Al-Matba'ah Al-Azhariyyah Al-Misriyyah, 1316 H), p. 39.

¹⁶ R.A. Nicholson, *Rumi: Poet and Mystic* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1950), p. 166 and 173.

¹⁷ Jane Idleman Smith, *Muslims, Christians, and the Challenge on Interfaith Dialogue* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), p. 79.

¹⁸ Sayyid Muhammad Naquib al-Attas, *The Mysticism of Hamzah Fansuri* (Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaya Press, 1970), p. 69; A.H. Johns, "Reflections on the Mysticism of Shams al-Din al-Samatra'i (1550?-1630), in *Lost Times and Untold Tales from the Malay World*, edited by Jan van der Putten and Mary Kilcline Cody (Singapore: NUS Press, 2009), p. 148-163.

¹⁹ Syed Muhammad Al-Naquib Al-Attas, *Comments on the Re-Examination of Al-Raniri's Hujjatu'l Siddiq: A Refutation* (Kuala Lumpur: Muzium Negara Kuala Lumpur Malaysia, 1975), p. 9.

²⁰ Yunasril Ali, *Manusia Citra Ilahi*, p. 129.

²¹ Tommy Christomy, *Signs of the Wali: Narratives at the Sacred Sites in Pamijahan, West Java* (Canberra: ANU E Press, 2008), p. 105; Emuch Hermansoemantri, *Sajarah Sukapura, Sebuah Telaah Filologis* (Dissertation at Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta, 1979), p. 93-96 dan 823.

²² Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Kinanti Jung Indit deui ti Bandung*, (Or. 7877); Iskandarwassid, Ajip Rosidi, Josep CD., *Naskah Karya Haji Hasan Mustapa* (Bandung: Proyek Sundanologi, 1987), p. 153, 157.

²³ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Kinanti Nu Pengkuh di Alam Tuhu* (Or. 7873); Iskandarwassid, Ajip Rosidi, Josep CD., *Naskah Karya Haji Hasan Mustapa*, p. 80.

²⁴ A.H. Johns, *The Gift Adressed to the Spirit of the Prophet*, p. 7, 130-131.

²⁵ Ibn 'Arabi, *al-Futuhat al-Makkiyah*, vol. IV, edited by Mahmud Matraji (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 2002), p. 303.

²⁶ Maire Byrne, *The Names of God in Judaism, Christianity and Islam, A Basis for Interfaith Dialogue* (New York: Continuum International Publishing Group, 2011), p. 125.

²⁷ William C. Chittick, "The Pluralistic Vision of Persian Sufi Poetry," *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*, 14:4 (2003), p. 425.

²⁸ Alexander Knysh, *Islamic Mysticism: A Short History* (Leiden: Brill, 2000), p. 166.

²⁹ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Kinanti Kidung Pucuk Mega Mendung* (Or. 7878); Iskandarwassid, Ajip Rosidi, Josep CD., *Naskah Karya Haji Hasan Mustapa*, p. 315 and 344.

³⁰ Panitia Kamus Lembaga Basa & Sastra Sunda, *Kamus Umum Basa Sunda* (Bandung: Penerbit Tarate, 1985), p. 187, 446, 447; Jonathan Rigg, *A Dictionary of the Sunda Language of Java* (Batavia: Lange & Co., 1862), p. 165, 420.

³¹ William C. Chittick, "The Pluralistic Vision of Persian Sufi Poetry," p. 426.

³² Annemarie Schimmel, *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1971).

³³ Syed Muhammad Naguib Al-Attas, *The Mysticism of Hamzah Fansuri* (Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaya Press, 1970); P.J. Zoetmulder, *Manunggaling Kawula Gusti, Pantheisme dan Monisme dalam Sastra Suluk Jawa*, translated by Dick Hartoko (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 1991), p. 369. S. Soebardi, *The Book of Cebolek* (Leiden: KITLV-The Hague-Martinus Nijhoof, 1975).

³⁴ Idries Shah, *The Sufis* (London: The Octagon Press, 1977), p. x.

³⁵ Samah Selim, "Mansur al-Hallaj and the Poetry of Ecstasy," *Journal of Arabic Literature*, Vol. 21, No. 1 (Mar., 1990), p. 26.

³⁶ Annemarie Schimmel, *As Through a Veil, Mystical Poetry in Islam* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1982), p. 9.

³⁷ Jajang Jahroni, "The Life and Mystical Thought of Haji Hasan Mustafa," Thesis at Leiden University, 1999, p. 62-63.

³⁸ Karel Steenbrink, "Qur'an Interpretations of Hamzah Fansuri (CA. 1600) and Hamka (1908-1982): A Comparison," *Studia Islamika*, Vol. 2, No. 2, 1995, p. 84.

³⁹ Kautsar Azhari Noor, *Ibn Al-'Arabi, Wahdat al-Wujud dalam Perdebatan* (Jakarta: Paramadina, 1995), p. 222.

⁴⁰ Sachiko Murata, *The Tao of Islam: A Sourcebook on Gender Relationships in Islamic Thought* (Albany: SUNY Press, 1992); William C. Chittick, "The Tao of Sufism," The Revised Edition of Proceedings of the 16th International Congress of Psychotherapy, Korean Academy of Psychotherapists, Seoul, 1995, p. 133.

⁴¹ Alexander Knysh, *Islamic Mysticism*, p. 167.

⁴² عن أبي هريرة رضي الله عنه أن النبي ﷺ قال لما خلق الله الخلق كتب في كتابه فهو عنده فوق العرش إن رحمتي تغلب غضبي وفي رواية إن رحمتي سبقت غضبي (متفق عليه).

⁴³ William C. Chittick, "A Sufi Approach to Religious Diversity, Ibn al-'Arabi on the Metaphysics of Revelation," in *Religion of the Heart: Essays Presented to Frithjof Schuon on*

His Eightieth Birthday edited by Seyyed Hossein Nasr and William Stoddart (Washington: Foundation for Traditional Studies, 1991), p. 83-84.

⁴⁴ Frithjof Schuon, *The Transcendent Unity of Religions* (Wheaton: Quest Books, 2005), p. 33; Seyyed Hossein Nasr, *Knowledge and the Sacred* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989), p. 293.

⁴⁵ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Asmarandana Ngagurit Kaburu Burit*, Cod. Or. 7876, UB Leiden University.

⁴⁶ Geoffrey Parrinder, *Mysticism in the World's Religions* (Oxford: One World, 1995), p. 4 and 185.

⁴⁷ S. Coolsma, *Soendaneesch-Hollandsch Woordenboek* (Leiden: A. W. Sijthoff's Uitgevers-Maatschappij, 1913), p. 317; Panitia Kamus Lembaga Basa & Sastra Sunda, *Kamus Umum Basa Sunda*, p. 264.

⁴⁸ Henry Corbyn, *Alone with Alone*, p. 179.

⁴⁹ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Kinanti Nu Pengkuh di Alam Tuhu* (Cod. Or. 7873), UB Leiden University; Iskandarwassid, Ajip Rosidi, Josep CD., *Naskah Karya Haji Hasan Mustapa*, p. 50-51.

⁵⁰ Media Zainul Bahri, "Ibn 'Arabi and the Trancendental Unity of Religions," p. 464.

⁵¹ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *144 Patakonan jeung Jawabna* (Bandung: Rahmat Cijulang, 1984), p. 24.

⁵² Reynold A. Nicholson, *The Mystics of Islam*, (Indiana: World Wisdom, 2002), p. 53.

⁵³ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *144 Patakonan jeung Jawabna*, p. 29.

⁵⁴ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *144 Patakonan jeung Jawabna*, pp. 24.

⁵⁵ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Arabic Letters from Bandung* (Correspondence with Snouck Hurgronje), 1911-1923, Cod. Or. 8952, March 9, 1920, UB Leiden University.

⁵⁶ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Asmarandana Nu Kami*, Bandung: Kiblat, 2009, p. 67; Iskandarwassid, Ajip Rosidi, Josep CD., *Naskah Karya Haji Hasan Mustapa*, p. 244-245.

⁵⁷ Nico J.G. Kaptein, *Islam, Colonialism and the Modern Age in the Netherlands East Indies*, pp. 191-192.

⁵⁸ Haji Hasan Mustapa, *Injaz al-Wa'd fi Itfa' al-Ra'd*, Cod. Or. 7205, UB Leiden University. Ajip Rosidi, *Haji Hasan Mustapa jeung Karya-karyana*, p. 440.

Bibliography

Ali, Yunasril. *Manusia Citra Ilahi, Pengembangan Konsep Insan Kamil Ibn 'Arabi oleh al-Jili*. Jakarta: Paramadina, 1997.

Al-Attas, Sayyid Muhammad Naquib. *The Mysticism of Hamzah Fansuri*. Kuala Lumpur: University of Malaya Press, 1970.

_____. *Comments on the Re-Examination of Al-Raniri's Hujjatu'l Siddiq: A Refutation*. Kuala Lumpur: Muzium Negara Kuala Lumpur Malaysia, 1975.

- Bahri, Media Zaenul. "Ibn 'Arabi and the Trancendental Unity of Religions." *AlJami'ah*, vol. 50, No. 2. 2012.
- Byrne, Maire. *The Names of God in Judaism, Christianity and Islam, A Basis for Interfaith Dialogue*. New York: Continuum International Publishing Group, 2011.
- Burhanudin, Jajat. *Islamic Knowledge, Authority and Political Power: The 'Ulama in Colonial Indonesia*. Leiden University, 2007.
- Chittick, William C. "A Sufi Approach to Religious Diversity, Ibn al-'Arabi on the Metaphysics of Revelation." in *Religion of the Heart: Essays Presented to Frithjof Schuon on His Eightieth Birthday* edited by Seyyed Hossein Nasr dan William Stoddart. Washington: Foundation for Traditional Studies, 1991.
- _____. *Imaginal Worlds: Ibn al-'Arabi and the Problem of Religious Diversity*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1994.
- _____. "The Tao of Sufism." The Revised Edition of Proceedings of the 16th International Congress of Psychottherapy, Korean Academy of Psychotherapists, Seoul, 1995.
- _____. "The Pluralistic Vision of Persian Sufi Poetry." *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*, 14:4. 2003.
- Christomy, Tommy. *Signs of the Wali: Narratives at the Sacred Sites in Pamijahan, West Java*. Canberra: ANU E Press, 2008.
- Coolsma, S. *Soendaneesch-Hollandsch Woordenboek*. Leiden: A. W. Sijthoff's Uitgevers-Maatschappij, 1913.
- Corbyn, Henry. *Alone with the Alone: Creative Imagination in the Sufism of Ibn 'Arabi*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969.
- Djelantik, Sukawarsini. "Terrorism in Indonesia: The Emergence of West Javanese Terrorist," The paper was presented at the 5th East-West Center International Graduate Student Conference, February 16-18 in Honolulu, Hawaii USA, 2006.
- Hermansoemantri, Emuch. *Sajarah Sukapura, Sebuah Telaah Filologis*. Dissertation at Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta, 1979.
- Homerin, Th. Emil. *From Arab Poet to Muslim Saint: Ibn al-Farid His Verse and His Shrine*. Cairo and New York: The American University in Cairo Press, 2001.

-
- Ibn 'Arabi. *al-Futuhat al-Makkiyah*, vol. IV, edited by Mahmud Matraji. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 2002.
- Iskandarwassid, Ajip Rosidi, Josep CD. *Naskah Karya Haji Hasan Mustapa*. Bandung: Proyek Sundanologi, 1987.
- Jahroni, Jajang. "The Life and Mystical Thought of Haji Hasan Mustafa (1852-1930)." Thesis at Leiden University, 1999.
- Al-Jili, *Al-Insan al-Kamil fi Ma'rifah al-Awa'il wa al-Awakhir*, vol. 1, Mesir: Al-Matba'ah Al-Azhariyyah Al-Misriyyah, 1316 H.
- Johns, A.H. *The Gift Adressed to the Spirit of the Prophet*. Canberra: Center of Oriental Studies A.N.U. 1965.
- _____. "Reflections on the Mysticism of Shams al-Din al-Samatra'i (1550?-1630)." in *Lost Times and Untold Tales from the Malay World*. Edited by Jan van der Putten and Mary Kilcline Cody. Singapore: NUS Press, 2009.
- Kaptein, Nico J.G. *Islam, Colonialism and the Modern Age in the Netherlands East Indies: A Biography of Sayyid 'Uthman (1822-1914)*. Leiden: Brill, 2014.
- Knysh, Alexander. *Islamic Mysticism: A Short History*. Leiden: Brill, 2000.
- Laffan, Michael Francis. *Islamic Nationhood and Colonial Indonesia, The Umma below the Winds*. London-New York: Routledge Curzon, 2003.
- Massignon, Louis. *'Alam al-Hallaj: Shahid al-Tasawwuf al-Islami*. trans. Al-Hussain Mustafa Hallaj. Damaskus: Shirkah Qadmus li al-Nashr wa al-Tauzi', 2004.
- Murata, Sachiko. *The Tao of Islam: A Sourcebook on Gender Relationships in Islamic Thought*. Albany: SUNY Press, 1992.
- Mustapa, Haji Hasan. *Injaz al-Wa'd fi Itfa' al-Ra'd*. Cod. Or. 7205. UB Leiden University.
- _____. *Kinanti Nu Pengkuh di Alam Tuhu*. Cod. Or. 7873. UB Leiden University.
- _____. *Asmarandana Ngagurit Kaburu Burit*. Cod. Or. 7876. UB Leiden University.
- _____. *Kinanti Jung Indit deui ti Bandung*. Cod. Or. 7877. UB Leiden University.

- _____. *Kinanti Kidung Pucuk Mega Mendung*. Cod. Or. 7878. UB Leiden University.
- _____. *Arabic Letters from Bandung (Correspondence with Snouck Hurgronje), 1911-1923*, Cod. Or. 8952, March 9, 1920, UB Leiden University.
- _____. *144 Patakonan jeung Jawabna*. Bandung: Rahmat Cijulang, 1984.
- _____. *Asmarandana Nu Kami*. Bandung: Kiblat, 2009.
- Nasr, Seyyed Hossein. *Knowledge and the Sacred*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989.
- _____. *The Garden of Truth: The Vision and Promise of Sufism, Islam's Mystical Tradition*. New York: Harper One, 2007.
- Netton, Ian Richard. *Muslim Neoplatonists: An Introduction to the Thought of the Brethren of Purity (Ikhwan al-Safa)*. London: Routledge Curzon, 2002.
- Newland, Lynda. "Under the Banner of Islam: Mobilising Religious Identities in West Java." *The Australian Journal of Anthropology*. 11: 2 (2000).
- Nicholson, Reynold A. *Rumi: Poet and Mystic*. London: Allen & Unwin, 1950.
- _____. *The Mystics of Islam*. Indiana: World Wisdom, 2002.
- Noor, Kautsar Azhari. *Ibn Al'Arabi, Wahdat al-Wujud dalam Perdebatan*. Jakarta: Paramadina, 1995.
- Panitia Kamus Lembaga Basa & Sastra Sunda. *Kamus Umum Basa Sunda*. Bandung: Penerbit Tarate, 1985.
- Parrinder, Geoffrey. *Mysticism in the World's Religions*. Oxford: One World, 1995.
- Rigg, Jonathan. *A Dictionary of the Sunda Language of Java*. Batavia: Lange & Co, 1862.
- Rohmana, Jajang A. "Sundanese Sufi Literature and Local Islamic Identity: A Contribution of Haji Hasan Mustapa's Dandangding." *Journal Al-Jamiah*, Vol. 50, No. 2 (2012): 303-327.
- Rosidi, Ajip. *Haji Hasan Mustapa jeung Karya-karyana*. Bandung: Pustaka, 1989.

- Schimmel, Annemarie. *Mystical Dimensions of Islam*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1971.
- _____. *As Through a Veil, Mystical Poetry in Islam*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1982.
- Schuon, Frithjof. *The Transcendent Unity of Religions*. Wheaton: Quest Books, 2005.
- Selim, Samah. "Mansur al-Hallaj and the Poetry of Ecstasy." *Journal of Arabic Literature*, Vol. 21, No. 1 (Mar). 1990.
- Shah, Idries. *The Sufis*. London: The Octagon Press, 1977.
- Smith, Jane Idleman. *Muslims, Christians, and the Challenge on Interfaith Dialogue*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Soebardi, S. *The Book of Cebolek*. Leiden: KITLV-The Hague-Martinus Nijhoof, 1975.
- Steenbrink, Karel A. *Kawan dalam Pertikaian, Kaum Kolonial Belanda dan Islam di Indonesia (1596-1942)*. Translated by Suryan A. Jamrah. Bandung: Mizan, 1995.
- _____. "Qur'an Interpretations of Hamzah Fansuri (CA. 1600) and Hamka (1908-1982): A Comparison." *Studia Islamika*, Vol. 2, No. 2, 1995.
- van Koningsveld, P.Sj. *Snouck Hurgronje dan Islam, Delapan Karangan tentang Hidup dan Karya Seorang Orientalis Zaman Kolonial*. Bandung: Girimukti Pasaka, 1989.
- Zoetmulder, P.J. *Manunggaling Kawula Gusti, Pantheisme dan Monisme dalam Sastra Suluk Jawa*. trans. Dick Hartoko. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 1991.